JOB SATISFACTION AMONG NURSING PERSONNEL WORKING IN GOVERNMENT AND PRIVATE TEACHING INSTITUTIONS: A QUESTIONNAIRE-BASED CROSS-SECTIONAL STUDY

Sudeshna Chatterjee*1, Krishnangshu Ray2 and Arcojit Ghosh3

1Deputy Registrar, Academic, Netaji Subash Open University, DD-26, Sector I, Salt Lake, Kolkata, West Bengal, India, PIN-700064.
2Director, Institute of Health and Family Welfare, GN-29, Sector-V, Salt Lake, Kolkata, West Bengal, India, PIN-700091.
3Sr. resident, Dept. of Anaesthesiology, K P C Medical College, 1F Raja S C Mullick Road, Jadavpur, Kolkata, India, PIN 700032.

*Corresponding Author: Sudeshna Chatterjee
Deputy Registrar, Academic, Netaji Subash Open University, DD-26, Sector I, Salt Lake, Kolkata, West Bengal, India, PIN-700064.

ABSTRACT
Satisfied Health professional is an asset to any resource-limited and high-burden disease setting institution in terms of efficiency, productivity and quality health care. Assessment of job satisfaction by validated and qualitative measures could ascertain the multi-faceted factors influencing it. A structured Questionnaire study was conducted upon a cross section of nursing personnel (n=200) serving two tertiary care teaching institutions of Kolkata under the governance of both public and private sectors respectively. Multiple demographic features were independent variables whereas three critical areas of Satisfaction Index (S.I.) were outcome variables. All nursing participants were interviewed by using 15 item Likert response-based and modified job satisfaction scale. In the private sector the S.I. scores remained higher in areas like availability of technical supports (P < 0.0003) and environmental ambiance (P < 0.0001) whereas the job security scores remained unaltered in both the sectors. However, total S.I. scores remained higher (P < 0.0006) in private sector. The study concludes that an user-friendly questionnaire survey could identify the intrinsic and extrinsic factors affecting the job satisfaction among the nursing personnel employed in both sectors. Necessary intervention measures might bridge the gaps so as to enhance the quality and growth of nursing care services in hospitals.

KEYWORDS: Satisfaction Index, Nursing Care, Cross Sectional Study, Teaching Institutions.

INTRODUCTION
Nurses’ job satisfaction is an important indicator in hospital practices since it influences the performances, patient behaviour and quality of care.[1] It is the most frequently studied variable in organisational behavioural research and used a central variable to study the organisational phenomena from job design to supervision.[2] As per Maslow’s hierarchy the human needs ranges between physiological needs and self-actualisation where job satisfaction represents the important component.[3,4] Intrinsic factors of good satisfaction are known as motivating factors (achievement, recognition, responsibility) whereas extrinsic factors are known to have been the hygiene factors or factor of dissatisfaction.[5]

Study of job satisfaction is a multi-dimensional, enduring important and much researched concept towards the growth of an organisation.[6] It is the job affective orientation of an employee towards his or her work which is related to attitudes about various facets of the job.[7] Low job satisfaction among nurse's inefficiency which affects their dedication to job and care.[8] Other factors influencing job satisfaction include level of pay and benefits, fairness of promotion, quality of working condition and social relationships.[9] Low job satisfaction contributes to nurse’s inefficiency which affects their dedication to job and care.[10] McManus[11] had conducted a study upon doctors which has shown that job satisfaction is inversely related with factors like absenteeism, stress exhaustion, and turn over. The present study has addressed two research questions:

a) What is the general job satisfaction of hospital nursing staff employed in both public and private sectors?
b) Which extrinsic and intrinsic factors contribute to the job satisfaction and dissatisfaction of hospital nursing staff?

The objective of the present study is to investigate the nurses’ perception of job satisfaction and its relevance with age, designation, salary and experience in different management set-up. It is possible that the outcome of the study may be an eye-opener to respective hospital authorities towards planning the future growth, organizational culture and job prospect.

**MATERIAL AND METHODS**

**Subjects**

Nursing personnel (n=200) employed at two tertiary care teaching institutions of Kolkata like RG Kar Medical College (government) and KPC medical College (private) had participated in the study. All participants were qualified in GNM (General Nurse cum Midwifery), B.Sc Nursing, M.Sc Nursing, Post Basic Nursing and ANM courses and holding the designation of Ward Sisters. All of them were both permanent and contractual employees of the respective institutions. The age of the participants ranged between 21-65 years.

**Data collection**

Primary data were obtained in the form of face to face interview method of the willing participants. Average time of data collection from each participants were fifteen (15) minutes. All data were anonymous and all responses were collected in closed boxes which were opened only at the time of analysis. The numerical values were converted into a computer based spread sheet. The study was prior approved by the Institutional Ethics Committee.

**Questionnaire Tool**

A self-administered, comprehensive, customized close ended questionnaire (n=15) were used to obtain information from the participants. Total 15 questions were classified into three domains such as (i) technical support obtained from the organization (ii) working environment of the institute and (iii) Security of jobs against the post. Target population was a representative cross section at single point of time within short time frame. The instrument was chosen as per the standard criteria related to job satisfaction like working conditions, supervision, pay, job itself, organisational profile and promotional avenue. [12] They suggested that the measurement tools should be i) useful to examine a wide variety of employees ii) to be understood by all participants iii) valid and reliable and iv) yield separate scores for different facets of job satisfaction.

**Calculation**

Response to each question was devised by using five point Likert Scale[13] and the level of satisfaction ranged between low to very high. The responses were further converted to Normal Scale for the ease of statistical calculation. The Score of job satisfaction index was calculated by using standard methods[14]

\[
\text{Job Satisfaction} = \frac{\text{Total obtained score for a respondent}}{\text{5 X Total number of questions}}
\]

**Statistical Analysis**

Students’ ‘t’ test was applied with the help of software www.vassarstats.net which uses graph pad version 7. P value less than 0.05 has been considered as significant.

**RESULTS**

**Socio-personal Profile of Respondent**

The ages of all respondents ranged between 21-65 years, out of which the participants from private sector (KPCMC) were relatively of lower (78%) age group (21-30 yrs.) than that of public sector (RGKMC) (34%) which ranged between (31-40 years) [Table 1 and Fig-1].

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Parameters</th>
<th>R. G. Kar (n=100)</th>
<th>K.P.C. (n=100)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>(a) Age Wise distribution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i)</td>
<td>21-30</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii)</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii)</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv)</td>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v)</td>
<td>60 Above</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>(b) Average working hour/week</td>
<td>44.15</td>
<td>49.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>(c) Academic Background</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i)</td>
<td>B.Sc. Nursing</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii)</td>
<td>GNM</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii)</td>
<td>M.Sc. Nursing</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv)</td>
<td>Post Basic</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v)</td>
<td>ANM</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Average Salary</td>
<td>7558.607</td>
<td>3447.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Average working hours remained higher in private sector (49.28%) than that of public sector (44.15%) [Table 1 and Fig-3].

Average remuneration per month (Rs. 7558.60) in public sector than in private sector (Rs. 3447.25) [Table 1 and Fig-4]

**Table-2.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>KPCMC (Mean±1.96SEM)</th>
<th>RGKMC (Mean±1.96SEM)</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SI of T</td>
<td>0.1404±0.0078</td>
<td>0.1188±0.0087</td>
<td>0.0003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI of E</td>
<td>0.1088±0.0122</td>
<td>0.078±0.0093</td>
<td>0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI of JS</td>
<td>0.0868±0.0085</td>
<td>0.088±0.0082</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total SI</td>
<td>0.112±0.0074</td>
<td>0.0951±0.0064</td>
<td>0.0006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Job Satisfaction Level**

The level of job satisfaction in terms of Job Satisfaction Index (JSI) was calculated by using the standard formula. Higher score indicated greater job satisfaction. JSI in totality remained significantly higher (0.112±0.0074 vs 0.095±0.0064) in KPCMC(private). Regarding the subdivisions of JSI in various sectors the nursing personnel serving KPCMC received higher technical supports (0.1404±0.0122 vs 0.1188±0.0087) than that of RGKMC. Working environment was expressed to be better at KPCMC (0.1088±0.0122 vs 0.078±0.0093) while compared to RGKMC. All values appeared to be statistically significant. Regarding the job security component both the sectors expressed more or less similar responses. [Table-2].
DISCUSSION
Job satisfaction has been defined as the degree to which individuals feel positive or negative about their jobs.[10] It is influenced by multiple factors like level of job, individual, professional, organisational and general working environment.[16,17] With special reference to nursing profession, other factors include job stress, nursing leadership, empowerment, salary and nursing autonomy.[18] Monitoring of nurses’ performance is an important indicator since dissatisfaction could be disruptive to patient care delivery and detrimental to organisational effectiveness. It has been observed that nurse’s job satisfaction results in positive patient outcomes and reduces patient falls.[19] The existing validated indicators of satisfaction among nursing personnel include IWS (Index of Work Satisfaction) which measures the extent to which people like their jobs.[20] IWS chiefly concerned to several dimensions like payment, professional strains, task requirements, interactions, organisational policies and autonomy on the basis of seven point Likert Scale.[21] However all these tools for measuring job satisfaction in nursing personnel suffer from reliability, validity and specificity. The present descriptive study aims towards developing an user-friendly instrument to measure nurses in job satisfaction cross-culturally and comparatively between public and private sector tertiary care hospitals.

The demographic data shows that the age range of the nursing personnel attached to the private sectors were comparatively lower than that of the public sectors which indicates a possibility of lesser work spirits in that particular group. Academically the private sector nurses carried higher qualification which indicates higher performance level in the concerned sectors. Financially public sector participants were compensated by higher salary which might reflect better degree of job satisfaction.

In the present study the socio personal profile of the participants were independent variables whereas three (3) critical areas of S I were outcome variables. On comparative analysis, total S I scores were higher in private sector than public which predicts enhanced healthcare outputs. The study has also observed that two important aspects of S I like availability of technical supports and environmental milieu in the private sector remained significantly better. This observation facilitates in rendering better care in accordance with their job charts. However S I score pertaining to job security in both the groups showed similar results which explains that the nursing services could be improved provided the aforesaid factors could be taken care of. The present observations has failed to establish any additional merit in terms of higher salary and promotional avenues amongst over the public sectors and private ones.

Zahaj et al.[22] has reported that the S I in nurses are influenced by intrinsic factors like ‘carrier growth’, ‘responsibility of work’, ‘equal interpersonal relationship’ and extrinsic factors like ‘salary’ and ‘working’ shift hours’. In the present study the nurses from Govt. Hospitals received better opportunities towards promotional benefits (linked with salary) but other issues got submerged due to overcrowding in hospitals. These observations are in agreement with the findings of present study. Tzeng.[23] had reported that academic inputs in the form of training had positively affect the job satisfaction of nurses. Another study had reported that relatively young and highly educated nurses are less satisfied.[24] The limitations of the present pilot study were small sample size and non-inclusion of the causal relationship between various factors. Additionally the study was conducted purely upon subjective rating and based upon self assessment of the respondents which might have been influenced by their lack of knowledge in the subject matter. The study also did not correlate the personal and demographic variables with S I.

CONCLUSION
It is concluded that respective institutional authorities should be cognizant about the intrinsic and extrinsic factors affecting job satisfaction since those have a great reflection upon their performance. Since nursing profession is the ‘heart beat’ of any hospital services their psychosocial and financial growth is expected to increase the total output. The present study has attempted to develop and standardize an user-friendly simple tool by identifying three critical factors which may be applied in future. Adequate supply of technical supports and ensuring the optimum environmental conditions at workplaces may enhance the job outputs. It is assumed that care giver’s satisfaction has got positive impacts upon the satisfaction of patients. It is recommended that respective employers should plan necessary intervention measures as a policy to achieve quality nursing care services in hospitals.

REFERENCES
11. McManus IC, Keeling A, Paice E. Stress, burnout and doctors’ attitudes to work are determined by personality and learning style: a twelve year longitudinal study of UK medical graduates. BMC Medicine, 2004; 2(29).